

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ח – כל הבשר

דף קח – 108 Daf

1. Deriving טעמו ולא ממשו from בשר בחלב

The next Mishnah states: טיפת חלב שנפלה על החתיכה – if a drop of milk fell onto a piece of meat cooking in a pot, אם יש בה בנותן טעם באותה חתיכה אסור – if [the milk] is enough to give flavor to the piece of meat, it is prohibited. Abaye said: [a prohibited food's] flavor without its substance is Biblically prohibited. Otherwise, why would we not derive that it is prohibited from מדאורייתא? Presumably, because – דחידוש הוא, *because* [the prohibition of בשר בחלב] is a novelty (in that two permitted substances become prohibited when combined, and that even the cooking itself is prohibited). But if it is a novelty, it should be prohibited even without imparting flavor, yet our Mishnah states that the milk must give flavor to the meat to prohibit it!? Rather, בשר בחלב must not be a novelty, and we can derive from it that טעמו ולא ממשו is prohibited מדאורייתא. Rava disagrees, and explains that although בשר בחלב is a novelty, תורה בשול אסרה תורה – the Torah prohibited [בשר בחלב] through cooking, which itself implies there is enough of each ingredient to impart flavor.

2. אפשר לסוחטו אסור, and חתיכה עצמה נעשית נבילה

The Mishnah taught that if a drop of milk fell onto a piece of meat in a pot and gives flavor to that piece, “it” is prohibited. Rav interprets this to mean that all the meat in the pot becomes prohibited, and explains: once the milk gave flavor to that piece of meat, חתיכה עצמה נעשית נבילה – the piece itself becomes like a *neveilah* (i.e., inherently prohibited), ואוסרת כל החתיכות כולן – and prohibits all the other pieces, regardless of their volume, because they are the same type as the forbidden meat. He interprets the Mishnah as following Rebbe Yehudah’s opinion, that בטל מין is never *batul*. When the forbidden piece of meat which had absorbed milk is cooked together with the other meat, the milk flavor is dispersed throughout the pot and may no longer be discernible in that first piece. Since Rav holds the piece itself is like a *neveilah*, and prohibits the other meat with its own flavor, he must hold אפשר לסוחטו – even when it is possible to “squeeze out” the forbidden flavor from [the piece], it remains prohibited. This opinion is shared by Rebbe Chanina and Rebbe Yochanan, but Shmuel, Rebbe Shimon bar Rebbe, and Reish Lakish hold אפשר לסוחטו מותר.

3. Combining חצי זית of בשר and חצי זית of milk

The Gemara discusses: חצי זית בשר וחצי זית חלב שבשולן זה עם זה – if one cooked a half-zayis volume of meat together with a half-zayis of milk, Rav says: לוקה על אכילתו – he incurs *malkus* for its consumption, but does not incur *malkus* for its cooking. The Gemara objects that these two rulings appear contradictory: אי מצטרפין – if they combine for *malkus* for consumption, he should be liable for cooking it as well. If not, he should not be liable for its consumption!? The Gemara answers that Rav holds they do not combine for a *shiur*. The case one is liable for their consumption is גדולה – where [the meat and milk] come from a large pot in which full measures of meat and milk were cooked together. Once all the meat and milk is prohibited as בשר בחלב, eating a half-zayis of each incurs *malkus*. Levi disagrees with Rav, and says one incurs *malkus* for cooking (or eating) a חצי זית of meat together with a חצי זית of milk.

Siman – Pickpocket (Based on קח)

When the בשר בחלב Rebbi realized he was being **pickpocketed by a talmid** who only ended up with a paper outlining how to derive טעמו ולא ממשו מדאורייתא from the fact that meat and milk become forbidden when cooked together, he dropped the piece of meat he was holding that had some milk on it into a pot of meat making the whole pot *assur* because אפשר לסוחטו אסור, and chased the **pickpocket** around the room knocking half a kezayis of meat into a pot with half a kezayis of milk.



When the **Rebbi** realized he was being **pickpocketed by a talmid** who only ended up with a paper outlining how to derive **טעמו ולא ממש בעלמא דאורייתא** from the fact that meat and milk become forbidden when cooked together, he dropped the piece of meat he was holding that had some milk on it into a pot of meat making the whole pot **assur** because **אפשר לסוחטו אסור**, and chased the **pickpocket** around the room knocking half a **kezayis** of meat into a pot with half a **kezayis** of milk.

3 things to remember

1. Deriving **טעמו ולא ממש בעלמא דאורייתא** from the fact that meat and milk become forbidden when cooked together
2. **חתיכה עצמה נעשית נבילה**, and **אפשר לסוחטו אסור**
3. Combining a **חצי זית** of meat and a **חצי זית** of milk

